

2.6 Connétable P.J. Rondel of St. John of the Minister for Economic Development regarding the qualifications of the Tug Master involved in an incident in September 2011:

Further to the Minister's assertions on 12th September 2011 that the Tug Master involved in an incident in September was highly qualified with a foreign-going Cargo Master unlimited certificate, has the States insurance company been made aware that the Master's qualifications are not recognised in Jersey or the UK and, if so, will Jersey now have to refund the sums paid to meet the cost of the States tug's repairs?

Senator A.J.H. Maclean (The Minister for Economic Development):

The insurance company was made aware of the Master's qualifications and have received a copy of the accident investigator's report. In response to the report they have asked for reassurance that recommendations have been addressed. They have not raised any issues relating to the Master's certificate or indicated that the claim, which has been settled in full, is being reviewed.

2.6.1 The Connétable of St. John:

Had the report findings been reported to the insurance company prior to making the results of the inquiry public, and, if so, were the company informed? Likewise, I note in the MECAL report that it is signed off by MECAL Jersey. That being the case did the insurance get made aware that on the Financial Services website that MECAL Jersey Limited were dissolved on 4th February 2010? Is this the same company that signed off the report on this accident? I will submit to the Minister the 2 documents from Financial Services and the bit of report where it says it for his use.

Senator A.J.H. Maclean:

Thank you. The claim with regard to the incident was made immediately, the insurance claim was paid in full in early November, the accident report was finalised in mid-November and obviously was published in a public forum. As I have already pointed out, the insurance company in question was made aware of the outcome and details of that particular report. As far as the company is concerned, MECAL... they are an international company, as the Connétable will be well aware - the International Marine Consultancy Certifying Authority in fact - and they are perfectly and appropriately placed to carry out this investigation. I have not been made aware of any incidences in relation to the company locally that would have any impact on the report that they undertook.

2.6.2 The Connétable of St. John:

Supplementary? Given that I raise these documents, that have been passed to the Minister, it is signed off on behalf of MECAL Jersey, an international company or not, on the Financial Services website, from which I downloaded this morning, on 4th February 2010 the company is reported as being dissolved. I am asking is this one and the same company?

Senator A.J.H. Maclean:

I cannot read this, the writing is too small. But nevertheless I am more than happy to check the point that the Connétable raises. What I will say is that content of the report was also checked and, in fact, the fact that MECAL was carrying out this particular investigation on behalf of the regulatory authority - that is in this instance Economic Development and not Jersey Harbours - they were checked with M.A.I.B., that is the Marine Accident Investigation Board, as to whether or not

MECAL was appropriate and they were satisfied that they were a perfectly appropriate organisation to carry out the report. With regard to this company's registry point that the Connétable has raised, I am certainly happy to check into that and report back.

The Bailiff:

Final question then, Connétable.

The Connétable of St. John:

Other Members may wish to ...

The Bailiff:

No, no other Member has indicated a wish to at all.

2.6.3 The Connétable of St. John:

I am only going to be given one final question. I have about 5 or 6 that need to be asked because I think it is wrong that the Minister is not up to speed on the subject matter. In particular where lives could be at risk and were at risk... and we saw the accident in Italy recently where a vessel hit the rocks. So given that you are only giving the opportunity to ask a final question I am asking the Minister, since he is not up to speed and he has been in this office now for coming up to 4 years, is he going to consider his position and resign because this is a resigning matter.

Senator A.J.H. Maclean:

No, is the short answer and, no, is the long answer. The Connétable is venturing a lot of opinion and I am afraid it is opinion that perhaps he is dressing up as fact. This incident he is comparing with the tragedy that happened in Italy. It is significantly different, it has been independently investigated, the report was critical in certain areas, in fact there were 8 recommendations of which 7 have been adopted by the Harbours Department and I am satisfied in that respect that all necessary actions have been taken and I would just say that both the Connétable and the *Jersey Evening Post*, for that matter, have to a degree been sensationalising this particular issue with inaccurate and misleading comments. I think we should be comforted here that issues that were raised have been addressed and, as I say, I am satisfied.

The Connétable of St. John:

On a point of clarification, could the Minister tell me where I am incorrect? I will willingly stand by this document if it is proved to be correct. I did say it came off the internet from the Jersey Financial Services Commission, and it is on their website. I asked if it was correct that this company had been dissolved and, likewise the other document I gave him, the report which I photocopied and it says: "For and on behalf of MECAL Jersey" it does not mention about the U.K. (United Kingdom). The report was done "MECAL Jersey". So is this company trading without being registered?

Senator A.J.H. Maclean:

I said that the Connétable has asked a valid question. I will seek to clarify the particular point and revert back to him. I am happy to circulate other Members with the answer, which I will do.